



## EDST 535 Comparative and International Adult Education

W2, January 2023

Tuesdays, 4:30–7:30pm

Room: 1215 Ponderosa Commons North

Instructor: Pierre Walter <http://edst.educ.ubc.ca/facultystaff/pierre-walter>

604-822-9231; Office: Ponderosa 3059; pierre.walter@ubc.ca

---

This course begins by acknowledging that the land on which we gather is the traditional, ancestral, and unceded territory of the Coast Salish Peoples, including the territories of the *xwməθkwəy̓əm* (Musqueam), *Skwxwú7mesh* (Squamish), *Stó:lō* and *Səlilwətaʔ/Selilwitulh* (Tsleil-Waututh) Nations.<sup>1</sup>

---

### Introduction

Across the world, the field of adult learning and education (ALE) has deep roots in community and international development, popular education and social movements. The latter include the global climate justice, Indigenous Rights, LGBTQ+, peace and justice, labour, women's, anti-racism and environmental movements. Within this international ALE tradition, research, scholarship and educative-activism focus primarily on securing human rights to education and improving the lives of marginalized, disempowered adult learners. These include impoverished farmers, labourers, elders, Indigenous peoples, refugees, women, racialized minorities, immigrants and others.

Several key global ALE organizations help to frame the main foci of comparative and international ALE. First among these is the [International Council for Adult Education](#) (ICAE), the primary international ALE body. Its mission is "to promote learning and education for adults and young people in pursuit of social justice within the framework of human right in all its dimensions, to secure the healthy, sustainable and democratic development of individuals, communities and societies." Likewise, [PIMA](#), a second international ALE network, "recognizes the importance of adult education and lifelong learning for the attainment of greater social, economic and ecological justice for individuals and collectives across all stages of life. We believe that learning and education are critical to solving the pressing issues of our times." Lastly, UNESCO's global Conference on Adult Education ([CONFINTEA](#)), held every 12 years (the 7th conference was in Morocco June, 2022), is aimed at "effective adult learning and education policies within a lifelong learning perspective and within the framework of the UN Sustainable Development Goals,..." and encourages UNESCO Member States "to put in place policies, incentives, regulatory frameworks and institutional structures and mechanisms to contribute to a human rights culture, social justice, shared values and sustainability."

Somewhat tempering the grand visions of ALE found in ICAE, PIMA and UNESCO are the forces of globalization, neoliberalism, technocracy and vocationalization of education, which continue to impact ALE from Canada to Malaysia, Iran to Mexico, China to South Africa, India to Vietnam, Italy to Ireland. On the one hand, adult education programs have increasingly come to resemble private internet, touristic or educational businesses, and global ALE programs and pedagogies are normalized as profit-making market commodities. On the other hand, untold new possibilities for creative, effective nonformal adult education, informal adult learning, and educative-activism have also arisen with the global internet and challenge the dominance of these same forces. The development of mobile phones, video, social media apps, streaming and other internet-based

- 
1. *Ask yourself, what does it mean to be uninvited guests on this land? What do you know about our settler-colonial history of land dispossession, violence and residential schooling over the last 500 years? About present-day continuances of this legacy locally and globally? Musqueam People and other First Nations have lived here for thousands of years before us. What responsibility as adult learners and educators do we have as "Canadians," as residents, or as "non-Canadians" as we occupy these Indigenous lands? What are the implications for comparative and international adult education?*

technology has opened up new forms of innovative adult learning and pedagogy, knowledge construction and educational exchange. The myriad forms of (ALE) – non-formal, informal and formal – are now, more than ever before, both global and local ("glocal").

Since we live increasingly within new global "societies" of the virtual world, we naturally also come to learn, teach and perhaps feel most at home in these non-physical spaces, and we often flourish within them. International ALE becomes an interconnected space where networks of community-based adult educators, scholars, professionals and activist-educators come together, exchange ideas and experiences, and promote ALE, lifelong learning and education (LLE) across a rich and tremendously diverse collective of global ALE settings, learners, pedagogies, programs and policies. They do this in real time, with physical people and real places, but also in dispersed time, with virtual people, in virtual spaces, and in various combinations of these. These varied spaces, times and peoples comprise the global community of ALE and the field of comparative and international adult education which we explore in this course.

## Objectives

This course engages the main global streams of theory, research and educational practice in international and comparative adult education. These include: settler-colonialism and decolonizing ALE, Indigenous ALE, social movement learning, lifelong learning and education, and popular education, across a wide range of places, people and issues. Many other areas of international and comparative adult education can be found in optional readings for the course, and deeper knowledge of these and other topics can be developed in individual and group assignments.

All participants in the course will have the opportunity to focus on ALE in countries, regions, local settings, programs, pedagogies and topics of particular interest to themselves, both individually and in small groups. Although the focus of this course is on informal and nonformal adult learning and education, all students interested in formal and / or children's education – in schools and higher education – are also welcome, and may freely pursue their interests in course assignments, discussions and other learning activities.

Participants in this course will:

- gain a critical understanding of the field of international and comparative ALE and its main areas of focus in theory, research and practice
- identify and explore areas in the field of particular interest to themselves
- learn how to critically analyze and evaluate published research articles in the field
- develop their skills in critical analysis, writing and oral presentation
- obtain a solid grounding in the traditions and methods of comparative education, and their application to topics of both individual and shared interest in the field
- develop their ability to write a research proposal to conduct empirical research in the field

## Readings

All required course readings are listed in the Course Timetable below (pp. 4-8) and are available through the UBC Library Course Reserves (LOCR) on your UBC Canvas EDST 535 homepage. Login at: <https://about.canvas.ubc.ca> Or go directly to UBC LOCR login: <https://courses.library.ubc.ca/>. Readings can also be easily accessed by cutting and pasting the title of a particular journal article into the UBC Library Catalogue <https://search.library.ubc.ca>

Please feel free to dip in, read ahead, read behind, read most of them now or read most of them later. However, please choose at least one reading of interest for each class period and read it carefully. Taken as a whole, your class readings will not only give you a good conceptual grounding in the field, but will also help to frame, explain and enrich your reflections and discussions.

## Assignments

This a seminar-style course in which students will have the chance both to develop and critique their general knowledge of the field of comparative education and to apply what they have learned to issues which are particularly meaningful to them. Our work will be both individual and collaborative.

**1. Comment Cards.** For 8 sessions of the course (see the Timetable below for dates), each class member is expected to write a Comment Card on one or more of the readings assigned for that class. A Comment Card is a typed half-page statement of no more than 250 words with:

- a) a brief example either in support of or in opposition to some point made in the readings for that class, **or**
- b) a comment or disagreement with something in the readings that class.

Please include a word count and the reference(s) for the reading(s) you are commenting on. Your comments should contribute something new to the discussion—a new example or idea; a critical perspective on concepts raised in the reading. They should not simply paraphrase or summarize the points made in the readings (a one or two sentence summary to start is sufficient, then move on to your own thoughts). We will use your Comment Cards as part of class discussion on days they are due. At the end of a given class, everyone turns in their cards to me. I will then read them and return them to you the following class session. Hold on to all of your Comment Cards (with my comments on them) and hand in all 8 together on the last day of class (March 28). Note: Only your 7 best Comment Cards will count for your grade.

**2. Country “Snapshot” Presentation** (5-10 mins). Working in pairs or small groups, choose a country (or region or local place), and conduct a basic internet search on some aspect of adult learning and education in that country. This may be a case study of a particular program, setting, group of adult learners, policy or issue. What is that is especially interesting, important or innovative about what you have chosen? How does it reflect any of the theories, articles or issues raised in our course readings? Present your findings to the class in 5-10 minutes, and allow 10-15 mins for discussion. You are not expected to become “experts” on the country, program, people or issue, but only to provide the class with enough information to raise informed questions. See Appendix A below, for resources to help with this assignment.

**3. Manuscript Review Paper** (1,500 words +/- 10%) of a review of a published research study in comparative adult education is required as part of the course (due Feb 14). This is a chance to apply your knowledge of theory and methods to a comparative education study of specific interest to you. It also provides a window into and practical experience in how academic research is evaluated and selected for publication in the field of comparative education. See Appendix B below, for assignment details.

**4. Research Proposal** (6,000 words +/- 10%) due on Tuesday, April 4 involve small groups writing original research proposals using primary sources. These collaborative proposals should build on individual manuscript review papers, a thorough literature review, and shared interests. All small groups will have class time to meet together and work on their Research Proposals in the last several weeks of the course. Each small group will present their work to the class in a seminar at the end of term. See Appendix C below, for details.

## Assessed Work for the Course

Please write all your class assignments in font size = 12 and hand in hard paper copies.

1. Comment Cards 25%
2. Country Snapshot 5%
3. Manuscript Review Paper 25%
4. Research Proposal 45%

See *Appendix D* below for EDST / UBC Grading Policy.

## Class Participation

Please attend all classes, read at least one reading for each class, and come to class prepared to listen and talk. You are expected to participate in all course activities, and at times to lead discussions and present your work to classmates. In addition, we will strive to develop certain qualities of respectful and engaged participation in learning. These include self-awareness, active listening, courtesy towards others, tolerance of different viewpoints and levels of comfort, a sense of humour, and delight in learning and collaboration. A suggestion for experimentation: If you normally prefer to listen, try talking (share your ideas!). If you are normally someone who likes to talk, try listening (what better way to learn?)



## Timetable

### Tues, Jan 10 What is Comparative & International Education?

Introduction & Course Overview

Watch Musqueam Elder Larry Grant's [Welcome Message](#)  
Watch Linc Kesler [Why We Acknowledge Musqueam Territory](#)  
Read UBC's Xwi7xwa Library's [Doing Land Acknowledgements](#)

- Elfert, M., & Monaghan, C. (2019). Comparative and international education: A field fraught with contradictions. *Annual Review of Comparative and International Education*, 37: 65-71.
- Holford, J., Milana, M., & Rasmussen, P. (2018). Adult education under a comparative lens: Areas of influence. *Annual Review of Comparative and International Education* 34. 85-93.
- Sanga, K. & Reynolds, M. (2020). A review of the emerging Indigenous Pacific research, 2000-2018. *The Annual Review of Comparative and International Education*, 39, 255-278.

➤ **Sign up for Country Snapshots**

### Tues, Jan 17 Global Trends: Settler-Colonialism & Decolonizing Adult Education

#### Comment Card # 1

Country Snapshot #1

Identifying Research Problems

- Prete, T., & Lange, E. (2021). Indigenous voices and decolonising lifelong education. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 40(4), 303-309.
- Poitras Pratt, Y. (2021). Resisting symbolic violence: Métis community engagement in lifelong learning. *International journal of lifelong education*, 40(4), 382-394.
- Hanson, C., & Jaffe, J. (2020). Decolonizing adult education. *The Handbook of Adult and Continuing Education*, 341-349.

## Tues, Jan 24 Inter-National Case Studies: Indigenous ALE

### Comment Card # 2

Country Snapshots #2

Demystifying academic publishing

- Yembuu, B. (2021). Intergenerational learning of traditional knowledge through informal education: the Mongolian context. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 40(4), 339-358.
- Nakagawa, S. (2021). Auto-decolonisation: Lifelong education for decolonisation. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 40(4), 359-371.
- Easby, A., Bergier, A., & Anderson, K. (2022). Exploring self-determined urban Indigenous adult education in an Indigenous organization. *Diaspora, Indigenous, and Minority Education*, 1-17. doi.org/10.1080/15595692.2022.2055542

## Tues Jan 31 International Sites of Social Movement Learning

### Comment Card #3

Country Snapshot #3

- Holst, J. D. (2018). From radical adult education to social movement learning. In *Palgrave International Handbook on Adult and Lifelong Education...* (pp. 75-92). London: Palgrave.
- Stuchul, D. L., Prakash, M. S., & Esteva, G. (2021). From fear to hope: learning from BIPOC in hard times – Covid 19, climate collapse & racial violence. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 40(4), 415-426.

### Chose One:

(to access an article, copy & paste the title into <https://search.library.ubc.ca>)

- Stewart, M., & Schultze, U. (2019). Producing solidarity in social media activism: The case of My Stealthy Freedom. *Information and organization*, 29(3), 1-23 [Iran]
- Fadaee, S. (2019). The permaculture movement in India: A social movement with Southern characteristics. *Social Movement Studies*, 18(6), 720-734.[India]
- Zhao, M. (2021). Solidarity stalled: When Chinese activists meet social movements in democracies. *Critical Sociology*, 47(2), 281-297. [U.S.]
- Lira, M., & March, H. (2021). Learning through housing activism in Barcelona: knowledge production and sharing in neighbourhood-based housing groups. *Housing Studies*, 1-20. doi.org/10.1080/02673037.2021.1921121 [Spain]
- Langdon, J. (2019). An unfractured line: an academic tale of self-reflective social movement learning in the Nova Scotia anti-fracking movement. *Environmental Justice, Popular Struggle and Community Development*, 83-100. [Canada]
- Sifuentes, M. E. (2021). Queer-decolonial pedagogy: Undoing binaries through intergenerational learning. *Journal of homosexuality*, 1-18. [U.S.]
- Kapoor, D. (2013). Anti-colonial subaltern social movement (ssm) learning and development dispossession in India. In *Learning with Adults* (pp. 131-150). Brill Sense. [India]
- Alfred, M. V. (2021). Race and the politics of exclusion: The socio-historical contexts of Black brutality and the emergence of the Black Lives Matter movement. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 170, 9-19. [U.S.]
- Young, A., Selander, L., & Vaast, E. (2019). Digital organizing for social impact: Current insights and future research avenues on collective action, social movements, and digital technologies. *Information and Organization*, 29(3), 1-6. doi.org/10.1016/j.infoandorg.2019.100257 [cyberspace]
- Irving, C. J., & English, L. M. (2011). Community in cyberspace: Gender, social movement learning, and the internet. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 61(3), 262-278. [cyberspace]

- Terriquez, V. (2015). Intersectional mobilization, social movement spillover, and queer youth leadership in the immigrant rights movement. *Social Problems*, 62(3), 343-362. [U.S.]
- Grayson, J. (2014). Migration and adult education: social movement learning and resistance in the UK. *European journal for Research on the Education and Learning of Adults*, 5(2), 177-194. [UK]
- Gerónimo-López, K., & Tormos-Aponte, F. (2021). Critical thinking and embodied learning for a Puerto Rican student movement pedagogy. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 2021(171-172), 55-67. [Puerto Rico]
- Kapoor, D. (2020). Critical adult education at the margins: Colonial racial capitalism and social movement learning in contexts of dispossession in the (neo) colonies. In *Critical Theorizations of Education* (pp. 44-57). Brill. [global]
- Gerónimo-López, K., Ramos Concha, G., & Holst, J. D. (2021). Adult education in Latin American and Caribbean social movements. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 171-172, 11-18. [Latin America and Caribbean]
- Roumell, E. A., & James-Galloway, A. D. (2021). Social movements, community education, and the fight for racial justice: Black women and social transformation. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 170, 21-31. [U.S.]
- Sehin, O., Coryell, J., & Stewart, T. (2017). Engendering hope: Women's (dis) engagement in change in Afghanistan. *Adult Learning*, 28(3), 91-98. [Afghanistan]
- Acuña Collado, V., & Ramos Concha, G. (2021). Adult education, human rights, and the problem of incarceration in Chile. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 171(172), 43-54. [Chile]

## Tues, Feb 7 Global Popular Education

### Comment Card # 4

#### Country Snapshot # 4

- Kuk, H. S., & Tarlau, R. (2020). The confluence of popular education and social movement studies into social movement learning: A systematic literature review. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 39(5-6), 591-604.
- Österborg Wiklund, S. (2022). In and against global injustice: Decolonising popular education on global development. *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 1-19. doi.org/10.1080/02660830.2021.1989903

#### Chose One:

(to access an article, copy & paste the title into <https://search.library.ubc.ca>)

- Glowacki-Dudka, M., & Connolly, B. (2017). Popular education from Ireland and the United States. *Mapping the Field of Adult and Continuing Education: An International Compendium*, 4, 571-578.
- Hendricks, N. & Mati, S. (2020). Counteracting xenophobia in South Africa through popular education. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 165, 49-61. [South Africa]
- Nordvall, H., & Pastuhov, A. (2020). The knowledge-oriented and relationship-oriented roles of popular education in labour movement parties in Sweden. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 39(4), 374-387. [Sweden]
- Haedicke, S. (2020). Coalition of Immokalee Workers: farmworker-led popular education and performance. *Research in Drama Education: The Journal of Applied Theatre and Performance*, 25(4), 576-580. [Florida, U.S.]
- Silver, J., Fields, D., Goulding, R., Rose, I., & Donnachie, S. (2021). Walking the financialized city: confronting capitalist urbanization through mobile popular education. *Community Development Journal*, 56(1), 161-179. [Manchester, England]
- Preston, R. (2018). Popular education in Andean America: the case of Ecuador. In *Education in Latin America* (pp. 92-108). Routledge. [Ecuador]

## Tues, Feb 14 Internatuional Lifelong Learning and Education

### Comment Card # 5

#### ➤ Manuscript Review Papers due

- McLean, S. (2022). Understanding the evolving context for lifelong education: global trends, 1950–2020. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 41(1), 5-26.
- Gouthro, P. A. (2022). Lifelong learning in a globalized world: The need for critical social theory in adult and lifelong education. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 41(1), 107-121.

#### Chose One:

(to access an article, copy & paste the title into <https://search.library.ubc.ca>)

- Hepburn, S., & Sintos Coloma, R. (2019). Ageing transmigrants and the decolonisation of life course. *International Journal of Lifelong Education*, 38(1), 48-66. [Jamaica]
- Camilo Recio, M., & Cabrera Romero, F. (2021). The long tradition of lifelong learning in Latin America and the Caribbean. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 171, 19-26. [Latin America & Caribbean]
- Cho, S. R. (2019). Lifelong Learning Through Cultural Learning, Citizenship Learning, and Community Engagement in Grassroots Communities in South Korea. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 162, 61-72. [Korea]
- Li, A. T., & Wei, H. C. (2019). Lifelong learning for aging people in Taiwan: Innovative programs and social effects. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 162, 97-110. [Taiwan]
- Guo, S., & Shan, W. (2019). Adult education in China: exploring the lifelong learning experience of older adults in Beijing. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*, 162, 111-124. [China]
- Thang, L. L., Lim, E., & Tan, S. L. S. (2019). Lifelong learning and productive aging among the baby-boomers in Singapore. *Social Science & Medicine*, 229, 41-49. [Singapore]
- Ignatovich, E., & Walter, P. (2022). Political posters, the Soviet Enlightenment and the construction of a learning society, 1917-1928. *European Journal for Research on the Education and Learning of Adults*, 13(1), 75-96. [Soviet Union]
- Thang, L. L., Lim, E., & Tan, S. L. S. (2019). Lifelong learning and productive aging among the baby-boomers in Singapore. *Social Science & Medicine*, 229, 41-49. [Singapore]
- Liu, H., Fernandez, F., & Grotlüschen, A. (2019). Examining self-directedness and its relationships with lifelong learning and earnings in Yunnan, Vietnam, Germany, and the United States. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 70, 1-8. [Germany, China, U.S., Vietnam]

## Tues, Feb 21 No Class UBC Reading Break (Feb 20-24)

## Tues, Feb 28 Writing Up Research Proposals

### ➤ Forming and scheduling of small groups for Small Group Research Proposal

- ☒ Writing Up Research: Proposal Headings
- ☒ Writing Up Research: 3-Move Schema

- Rust, V. D. (2003). Method and methodology in comparative education. *Comparative Education Review*, 47(3), iii-vii.
- Rust, V. D., Soumaré, A., Pescador, O., & Shibuya, M. (1999). Research strategies in comparative education. *Comparative Education Review*, 43(1), 86-109.
- Mukherjee, M. (2019). Southern theory and postcolonial comparative education. In *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Education*. doi.org/10.1093/acrefore/9780190264093.013.466

## Tues, March 7 Peace Education

### ➤ Small Group Research Proposal Progress Reports & Working Time

#### ➤ Comment Card # 7

- Wirtu, D. (2018). Peace education: a missing link in the adult education sub-sector of Ethiopia?. *Ethiopian Journal of the Social Sciences and Humanities*, 14(1), 31-52.
- Nozawa, A. (2020). Peace education program in Hiroshima: An artful narrative of transformative experiences. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*, 32(2), 49-61.
- Hammond, J. L. (2019). Popular Education and the Reconstruction of El Salvador. In *Latin American Education* (pp. 349-371). Routledge.

## Tues, March 14 Refugee Education

### ➤ Small Group Research Proposal Progress Reports & Working Time

#### ➤ Comment Card # 8

- Ugurel Kamisli, M. (2021). Acculturation experiences of Syrian Muslim refugee women in the United States: Intersectionality of nationality, religion, gender, and refugee status. *Adult Learning*, 32(3), 103-114.
- Thomsen, S. L., & Weilage, I. (2021). Scaling up and crowding out: how German adult education centers adapted course offers to refugee integration. *Adult Education Quarterly*, 1-21. DOI: 10.1177/07417136211068861
- Bajwa, J. K., Kidd, S., Abai, M., Knouzi, I., Couto, S., & McKenzie, K. (2020). Trauma-informed education support program for refugee survivors. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*, 32(1), 75-96.

## Group Research Proposal Progress Reports

## Tues, March 21 ALE Local-Global Futures

### ➤ Small Group Research Proposal Progress Reports & Working Time

- Stein, S., Andreotti, V., Suša, R., Amsler, S., Hunt, D., Ahenakew, C., ... & Okano, H. (2020). Gesturing towards decolonial futures: reflections on our learnings thus far. *Nordic Journal of Comparative and International Education (NJCIE)*, 4(1), 43-65.
- Igbu, S., Peltier, S., Morford, A. C., & Rizarri, K. (2022). BIPOC Solidarities, Decolonization, and Otherwise Kinship through Black Feminist Love. *WSQ: Women's Studies Quarterly*, 50(1), 187-204.
- Kluttz, J., Walker, J., & Walter, P. (2020). Unsettling allyship, unlearning and learning towards decolonising solidarity. *Studies in the Education of Adults*, 52(1), 49-66.

## Tues, March 28 Seminar: Group Research Proposals

### ➤ Final Research Proposals due Tuesday, April 4

## **Appendix A. Resources**

### **Journals**

*Adult Education and Development*

*Adult Education Quarterly*

*Canadian and International Education / Education canadienne et internationale*

*Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education*

*Comparative Education*

*Comparative Education Review*

*Comparative Studies in Society and History*

*Compare*

*Convergence*

*Current Issues in Comparative Education*

*European Journal for Research on the Education and Learning of Adults*

*European Journal of Education*

*Gender and Education*

*International Journal of Educational Development*

*International Journal of Lifelong Education*

*International Review of Education*

*Journal of Education Policy*

*New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education*

*Oxford Studies in Comparative Education*

*Prospects: Quarterly Review of Education*

*Studies in the Education of Adults*

### **Websites (not exhaustive)**

- International Council on Adult Education (ICAE) [www.icae2.org](http://www.icae2.org)
- World Council of Comparative Education Societies [www.wcces.net](http://www.wcces.net)
- Comparative Education Research Center, Hong Kong University  
<http://www.fe.hku.hk/cerc/Links/links.htm>

With links to:

- Comparative Education Societies
- Comparative and International Education Research Centres
- Academic Resources and Databases
- International Education
- National Education
- Regional Education

### **UNESCO** reports and data:

- [Adult learning and education](#), UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning.
- [Global report on adult learning and education](#), UNESCO, 2009.
- [Second global report on adult learning and education: Rethinking literacy](#), UNESCO, 2013.
- [Third global report on Adult learning and education](#), UNESCO, 2016.
- See also, [national report of each country and monitoring data](#).
- [UNESCO recommendation on adult learning and education](#), UNESCO, 2015.

## **Appendix B. “Manuscript” Review Paper**

Your **1,500-word** (+/- 10%) review (**due Feb. 14**) of a published research study in comparative adult education is required as part of the course. The study you select to review should **not** be a literature review or ‘concept paper’, but should involve empirical research of some sort. Assume that you are on the editorial board of the journal you have chosen and have been asked to evaluate the manuscript for publication in that journal (even though the paper has actually already been published...).

This manuscript review paper is a chance to apply your knowledge of theory, content and methods in comparative education to a research study of specific interest to you. It also provides practical knowledge and experience of how academic research is evaluated and selected for publication in the field. Later in the course, when you conduct and write up your own group research proposal, you will then have a solid understanding of what constitutes publishable research and how to evaluate it.

In other words, what I am asking you to do for this review paper is to critically evaluate a published piece of research in comparative education as an official peer ‘reviewer’ for an academic journal in your field. Please choose an article of interest to you from one of journals listed in the Course Description (p. 9 above) or from another peer-reviewed academic research journal in adult comparative education. In reviewing the article, follow the evaluation guidelines on the back of this page. These are typical guidelines sent out to journal referees when we assess a manuscript submitted for publication. For the purposes of our class, the “Narrative Assessment” is what will comprise the bulk of your review paper.

In general, your review should:

- be easy to read (well organized; concise; proofread for errors of grammar, spelling, and diction)
- make connections to pertinent readings or concepts
- move beyond summarizing
- provide examples and explanations
- shape facts and personal insights into a structured argument
- demonstrate the ability to reflect critically on assumptions and ideology
- use inclusive language (non-sexist, non-racist, non-heterosexist)
- provide adequate references

When you hand in your paper, please provide me with:

- (1) **a printed copy of the article** you reviewed (this can be your own working copy) and
- (2) **a printed copy of the journal’s statement of scope or purpose** (you may need to go to the journal’s website to find this).

# Sample Manuscript Review form

## **A** | Manuscript Review Form

**E** | *Adult Education Quarterly*

**Q** | \_\_\_\_\_

Manuscript Number:

Manuscript Title:

Reviewer #:

Date Review Completed:

The review process calls for reviewer summary recommendation and open narrative comment.

I. **SUMMARY RECOMMENDATION:** *Please select one*

\_\_\_\_\_ Conditionally Accept      \_\_\_\_\_ Revise and Resubmit      \_\_\_\_\_ Reject

**Note:** If you are recommending rejection, please state the main reasons in box 'f' below. If you are recommending conditional acceptance or revise and resubmit, please provide specific recommendations that will guide the authors in improving their work by completing boxes 'a-f' below.

II. **NARRATIVE ASSESMENT:** Type an assessment directed to the author(s) stressing the article's strengths and weaknesses. Indicate unresolved problems for publication and provide specific suggestions for improvement of the manuscript. In your narrative, consider the following criteria as appropriate. The **importance of the problem** means the degree to which the problem or subject contributes to knowledge or theory pertinent to adult education. **Methodological soundness** includes considering whether the methods are appropriate for addressing the research problem, and whether the manuscript includes an introduction to the problem, a stated purpose and research questions where appropriate, and a review of relevant literature. The **inferences and conclusions** should be pertinent and clearly drawn from the findings; importance to the field should be described. Finally, the manuscript should be **well organized, well written, and readable**.

Please use the following questions in your assessment. Simply click inside the box and begin typing. The text will wrap.

a. How important is the research and/or theoretical problem? How well-defined is the purpose?

b. How well-developed and appropriate are the theoretical frameworks and literature reviews?

c. How sound are the methodological approaches?

d. How well-supported and convincing are the inferences and conclusions? Are the theoretical and practical implications appropriately indicated?

e. How well-organized, well-written, and readable is the manuscript?

f. Additional comments:

## **Appendix C. Group Research Proposal Guidelines**

Your Group Research Proposal (maximum of 6,000 words +/- 10%) **due on Tues, April 4**, is a proposal for an original study in comparative adult education using primary sources. The proposal should take the form of a document ready to submit to granting agencies (review SSHRC Standard Research Grants webpages) or to your thesis committee at UBC (see EDST or other department webpages for guidelines). When writing your proposal, please take into account the review guidelines (*Appendix B*) you used to evaluate published research articles earlier in the course. Also remember the *Writing Up Research: Proposal Headings* reviewed in class Feb. 28.

As you are thinking through your proposal, you might examine academic journals which have a scope and purpose appropriate to your research. Read the journal's 'Guidelines for Contributors' (or the equivalent) for a better sense of what publishable research looks like in your field. Guidelines for contributors can generally be found inside the back cover of journals or on their websites. Likewise, a journal's statement of scope or purpose is often found inside the front cover or on the website.

In general terms, your research proposal should have the following:

- (1) a clear rationale as to why this is an important research topic, as evidenced from an argument built on a literature review, policy or other documents, and a brief contextual description of the problem's larger importance. The reader should know what your question/topic is and why it is important by the end of the first page.
- (2) a well-developed theoretical framework positioning the research problem within some limited body of knowledge. The *Writing Up Research: Three-Move Schema* reviewed in class Feb. 28 should help you here.
- (3) a sound and appropriate methodological approach, including why you chose this approach, research design, data collection and analysis methods;
- (4) potential findings clearly outlined, and how they will likely contribute to theory and practice in your field
- (5) an appendix with a research plan including timeline, resources needed and budget
- (6) an appendix with three potential assessors for your proposal. These should be faculty members at UBC or anywhere in the world who have the necessary expertise to evaluate your proposal. Journal editorial boards are good places to start to look for assessors. Researchers you have cited in your literature review are also good possibilities. Include one-page faculty webpage or summary of each assessor's qualifications with your proposal.

Top three reasons why committees reject research proposals:

- Incomplete literature review
- Lack of theoretical rationale
- Lack of specificity in the methodology

Your proposals should be easy to read (well-organized; concise; proofread for errors of grammar, spelling, and diction), make connections to pertinent course readings, use inclusive language (non-sexist, non-racist, non-heterosexist), and provide adequate references.

Together with your proposal, please include an appendix with a **Summary Statement** of the following:

- Your group's proposal title and members
- Why you chose the topic / how you negotiated it
- What knowledge and experience each group member brought to the topic
- What each group member did
- What you learned of value to your future work
- What you might do differently next time (the research process; writing process; group process)
- Each group member's personal assessment of her or his individual work for the project (including a grade), and an assessment of the group as a whole (including a grade)

## **Appendix D. Various Important UBC and EDST Policies and Resources**

### **EDST Graduate Course Grading Policy (from the EDST website)**

#### **A Level (80% to 100%)**

A+ is from 90% to 100%. It is reserved for exceptional work that greatly exceeds course expectations. In addition, achievement must satisfy all the conditions below.

A is from 85% to 89%. A mark of this order suggests a very high level of performance on all criteria used for evaluation. Contributions deserving an A are distinguished in virtually every aspect. They show that the individual (or group) significantly shows initiative, creativity, insight, and probing analysis where appropriate. Further, the achievement must show careful attention to course requirements as established by the instructor.

A- is from 80% to 84%. It is awarded for generally high quality of performance, no problems of any significance, and fulfillment of all course requirements. However, the achievement does not demonstrate the level of quality that is clearly distinguished relative to that of peers in class and in related courses.

#### **B Level (68% to 79%)**

This category of achievement is typified by adequate but unexceptional performance when the criteria of assessment are considered. It is distinguished from A level work by problems such as:

1. one or more significant errors in understanding
2. superficial representation or analysis of key concepts
3. absence of any special initiatives
4. lack of coherent organization or explication of ideas

The level of B work is judged in accordance with the severity of the difficulties demonstrated.

B+ is from 76% to 79%.

B is from 72% to 75%.

B- is from 68% to 71%.  
C+ is from 64% to 67%  
C is from 60% - 63%

The Faculty of Graduate Studies considers 60% as a minimum passing grade for graduate students. Students should check the University Calendar for information on what constitutes “Satisfactory Progress” for master's and doctoral students. In general, a grade of 68% must be maintained to remain in good standing. See the Faculty of Graduate Studies section of Calendar for more information.

### **Academic Misconduct**

In response to the university's growing concern with academic misconduct, EDST has decided that all instructors in the Department will include in their course outlines an explicit statement about academic misconduct, beginning in September 2008. A statement on this issue is provided here:

“The integrity of academic work depends on the honesty of all those who work in this environment and the observance of accepted conventions such as acknowledging the work of others through careful citation of all sources used in your work. Plagiarism - including self-plagiarism - and other forms of academic misconduct are treated as serious offences at UBC, whether committed by faculty, staff or students. You should be aware of the sections of the University Calendar that address academic integrity (<http://students.ubc.ca/calendar/>) and plagiarism (<http://vpacademic.ubc.ca/academic-integrity/ubc-regulation-on-plagiarism/>). The UBC library also has a useful web-based Plagiarism Resource Centre that explains what plagiarism is and how to avoid it ([www.library.ubc.ca/home/plagiarism/](http://www.library.ubc.ca/home/plagiarism/)). If you have questions or concerns about any of these policies or conventions in relation to how they apply to the work you do in this course, please discuss them with your instructor.”

### **Religious Observances**

Whenever possible, students will be given reasonable time to make up any session that is missed due to participation in a religious observance. It is the student’s responsibility to inform the instructor of any intended absences for religious observances in advance.

### **Students with Disabilities**

If you require an accommodation in this course, please let me know as soon as possible and/or provide me with documentation and recommendations from UBC Access & Diversity. You can find more information about the services provided by Access & Diversity at <http://www.students.ubc.ca/access/index.cfm>

### **University Policies**

UBC Senate Policy V-130 pertains to the Content and Distribution of Course Syllabi:  
<https://senate.ubc.ca/sites/senate.ubc.ca/files/downloads/Policy-20190207-V-130-Syllabus.pdf>

The following statement is a required element of UBC course syllabi: “UBC provides resources to support student learning and to maintain healthy lifestyles but recognizes that sometimes crises arise and so there are additional resources to access including those for survivors of sexual violence. UBC values respect for the person and ideas of all members of the academic community. Harassment and discrimination are not tolerated nor is suppression of academic freedom. UBC provides appropriate accommodation for students with disabilities and for religious and cultural observances. UBC values academic honesty and students are expected to acknowledge the ideas generated by others and to uphold the highest academic standards in all of their actions. Details of the policies and how to access support are available here: [https://senate.ubc.ca/policies-resources-support-student-success\)](https://senate.ubc.ca/policies-resources-support-student-success))”.

## Student Information

Please complete and hand in during the first or second class.

Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Student #: \_\_\_\_\_

Phone # \_\_\_\_\_

E-Mail: \_\_\_\_\_

Specialization/Subjects:

---

---

---

---

Do you have any situation **that you would like me to be aware of** that affects your learning (e.g. hearing or visual impairment, chronic health problem, learning disability, etc.)?

---

---

---

Hopes/fears/concerns/questions about the course:

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---

---