**CONSTRUCTING CITIZENS: CANADA AND THE EDUCATIONAL PAST**

EDST 509 Sec 81  
Department of Educational Studies  
Faculty of Education  
UBC  

Winter 1, 2018  

Tuesday, 4:30-7:30  
Ponderosa Commons, Oak House (PCOH) 1009  

Instructor:  Dr. Jason Ellis (PhD, MA York; B.Ed., OISE-Toronto; BAH, Queen’s)  
E-mail:  j.ellis@ubc.ca  
Office: Ponderosa Commons, Oak House (PCOH) 3081  
Office hours: Monday, 3:15-4:45 PM; Friday, 9:00-10:30 AM; or by appointment.  
Office phone: 604-822-9190  

---

**Course description:**

Schools construct citizens. This can mean different things. Sometimes it means that schools construct identity: Canadian, Indian, settler, First Nations, boy, girl, woman, man, able, disabled, homosexual, heterosexual, and so on. Sometimes it means that schools prepare young people to participate as citizens in a society, by fashioning them into moral subjects, future voters, wage- and home-workers, mothers, and fathers.

Citizens also, however, construct schools. They place demands on schools that give shape to the type of education found therein. They have a say in what gets taught, who gets taught, and to what end.

The history of education—the academic discipline this course is concerned with—is a window into these processes of schools constructing citizens and citizens constructing schools, as both have changed over time.

Historians who study these processes, while they might agree on some of the basic details (dates, places), do not agree on the exact causes and effects of historical change; nor on the types of primary source evidence that best enable us to understand that change; nor on how to interpret the evidence.
Consequently, our goals in this course are:

1) Together we will study how Canadian schools and educational institutions of all sorts have constructed citizens. You will read secondary source literature by historians who have examined these topics.

2) You will learn as well how to do history of education. That is, you will learn how to conduct research in the history of education field and how to present that research in writing and verbally.

You will learn how to read and interpret primary historical sources. Much of Canada’s educational history, especially as it concerns the construction of citizens, is yet unwritten. You will learn how to locate primary sources in archives and libraries. You will learn how to analyse these sources and make inferences. You will learn how to weigh and present historical evidence and formulate a historical argument. Using these sources, you will write your own histories of “Constructing citizens: Canada and the Educational Past.” You will realize “that history is never done” and you will become, as the British historian G.R. Elton once wrote, “a member of a band jointly engaged in trying to disentangle the truth about the past.”

This is a course about Canada and the Indigenous peoples within it. Where readings are available, it also focuses as much as possible on the local: the First Nations of the places we are at; the province of British Columbia; and, the city of Vancouver.

**Note on optional readings for students unfamiliar with history or with Canada as a context:**
Sections from three optional general textbooks about Canada listed below under course materials (Barman; Conrad, Finkel, and Fryson; Dickason and Newbigging) correspond to each of the course’s weekly required readings in Canadian educational history. These sections from the optional readings offer social, cultural, and political context for the required readings. **We will not take up the optional readings in class. However, if you are unfamiliar with Canadian history generally, the optional readings may provide some of the context you find yourself missing.** The best way to use these readings is as a reference. If there are events and historical developments, themes, or ideas that are unfamiliar in the required readings, you can learn more about them by looking them up in the optional ones.

---

Course materials:

There are three **required books** for you to purchase or borrow on library reserve for this course:


These books are available at the UBC bookstore. I have also asked the UBC Libraries to place one copy of each on reserve for you to borrow.

In addition to the required texts, there are three **optional books** for purchase for this course. You are not required to purchase these. **See above, “Note on optional readings,”** for information about these books that will help you to decide if you wish to purchase them or not.


Other readings for this course are available electronically. Links are posted on Canvas.

Seminar expectations:

Your success in the course depends on the contributions that you, and your colleagues, make to the class as a learning community. In a seminar course my minimum expectation is that students will arrive having read the required readings and prepared to engage with their colleagues about key ideas and questions related to the readings.
Each week’s readings come with pre-assigned seminar questions written by me. However, in a graduate level course, it is expected that students are self-starters who come to class with seminar questions for each other. Consequently, you should feel yourself required, in preparing your notes, to go beyond answering my assigned questions.

**Evaluation:**

**All assignments for this course are submitted online, on Canvas. I do not – except under exceptional circumstances – accept paper or emailed copies of assignments.**

| A) Short writing assignment. 20% |
| B) Group seminar project. 30% |
| C) Final assignment (essay or oral exam). 40% |
| D) Active class participation. 10% |

**A) Short writing assignment (20%)**

Due: Friday, 14 September 2018, by 11:59 PM – Submitted on Canvas.

Why did governments in Canada create a system of free, secular public schools in the nineteenth century?

- Your answer must be in essay form.
- You must have a thesis.
- You must present evidence supporting your thesis.
- In answering the question, you should use the secondary and primary sources for Class 2. You may - if you wish - consult additional secondary or primary sources, but this is not a requirement.
- The paper will be between 3 to 7 pages in length, double-spaced, 12-point font.
- The paper must be appropriately referenced; it must correctly employ the formatting conventions of Chicago, or APA, or MLA. (I.e. title page, footnotes or parenthetical references, bibliography, proper margins, etc.)
• Your paper will be evaluated on the quality of your thesis, appropriateness of the evidence you present to support that thesis, and on writing and organization (proper introduction, conclusion, thesis, paragraphing, topic sentences, etc.) (See the rubric for written work at the end of the syllabus.)

### B) Group Seminar Project (30%)

Due: Throughout the course (sign up for a week on Canvas).

Working in groups of at least two (and no more than three) your task is to chair, facilitate, and lead the discussion of a weekly topic and the secondary and primary sources that have been assigned for that topic.

Plan your seminar for a duration of approximately 90 minutes. No more than 15 minutes of lecturing/formal presenting by group members will be allowed. As chairs for the class discussion, most of your objectives will be achieved through the discussion that you will lead.

Prepare a handout. The handout may not be longer than two pages (single-spaced). The only required content is the information stated in “iii) Sources for further research” outlined below. The rest of the handout’s content is up to you.

Your seminar (the presentation or discussion) must cover these important elements:

i) Discussion of secondary source readings (Weighting: 12.5%).
   • How do the readings address this week’s topic?
   • What main argument does the author of each reading make?
   • What types of historical evidence are used to present this argument?
   • Are the argument, and supporting evidence, convincing? Why? Why not?
   • Where does this author’s interpretation fit in the historical literature on the topic, on the history of education more broadly?

ii) Discussion of primary source readings (Weighting: 12.5%).
   • Discuss how the primary source readings relate to the history presented in the secondary source readings.
   • Discuss how the primary source readings add to the history presented in the secondary source readings and how they add to the history the week’s topic covers more generally. What additional insights does your analysis of the primary sources bring to this topic?
iii) Sources for further research (Weighting: 5%).

- Locate and present to the class at least one archival, library, or digital collection that would enable a person to do further research on this topic using primary sources. For e.g., a fonds in an archives; a digital repository of historical documents; a special collections in a library. These sources and their precise location (e.g. library or archives, URL, call numbers etc.) must be included in your handout.

C) Final Assignment (40%):

For the final assignment, you may choose one of two approaches.

Approach I: Conventional research essay.

Due: Friday December 7th, 2018, by 11:59 PM – Submitted on Connect.

- A conventional historical research essay on a topic of your choice, involving original primary sources and secondary source material. The paper will be 12-25 pages in length, double-spaced, 12 point font, must be appropriately referenced, and must correctly employ the formatting conventions of Chicago, APA, or MLA. (i.e. title page, footnotes or parenthetical references, bibliography, proper margins, etc.)

- Topic selection: you may select any topic you wish. You could write an essay related to the topic that your group chose for its group seminar, using primary sources from the “sources for further research” from your presentation. Or, you may choose to pursue a new topic. You may not write your paper on the topic of Class 2 as you will have already been evaluated on this topic.

- Your essay must have an original thesis. Your essay must present evidence supporting your thesis and related claims.

- Your essay must employ primary and secondary sources.
  - **Primary sources:** Construct an original thesis using those sources.
  - **Secondary sources:** Situate your thesis within the secondary literature that you consulted. To what extent does your thesis draw on the work of authors? What does your original thesis add to that literature?
• Conduct research. Your research essay may involve course readings. However, you must also demonstrate that you have done considerable in-depth research and analysis that goes beyond the course materials.

You will be evaluated on this, on the strength of your thesis, and on your ability to present evidence supporting your thesis that is coherent and convincing. (See the rubric for written work at the end of the syllabus.)

Or, Approach II: Oral examination and short paper (2-5 pages).

Due: Ongoing, 60 minute blocs, scheduled days or evenings from December 3rd-7th, 2018. Short paper submitted on Canvas 24 hours after oral examination.

• Select two weekly topics on which you would like to be examined. You may not choose the weekly topic your group presented on; nor may you choose the topic from Week 2, as you will have already been evaluated on this topic. You will sign up on Canvas.

• The oral examination will last 45 to 60 minutes (Weighting 35%).

• The oral examination will touch on secondary sources only. It will consist of two types of questions: (i) broad questions designed to test your knowledge about the weekly topics you have selected (not just “dates and facts”); (ii) questions about how the different authors you read constructed their historical arguments using evidence.

• You will also submit a short paper (2-5 pages, double spaced). (Weighting 5%).

• For the short paper, you will choose one primary source from each of the two weekly topics that you selected for your oral examination. You will summarize each primary source and describe how it relates to the weekly topic it was assigned under.

• You are permitted to bring a one-page, single-sided, single-space, 10-point font, “crib sheet” to the oral examination.

D) Class participation (10%):

You will be evaluated on the quality and consistency of your contribution to the class.
**Academic honesty (plagiarism and cheating)**

UBC has a clear academic integrity policy. You are expected to review, understand, and follow that policy:

http://www.calendar.ubc.ca/vancouver/index.cfm?tree=3,54,111,0

UBC Library also has a helpful set of suggestions for referencing work and citations:

http://learningcommons.ubc.ca/resource-guides/avoid-plagiarism/

All work submitted for this course must be submitted to this course only, must comprise your own words and ideas, and must not contain any material that is copied from any other source – *unless that material is accurately quoted and/or acknowledged, and referenced*. The penalties for academic misconduct are serious and range from a letter of reprimand to degree revocation.

Should you ever have any question about how to quote, acknowledge, or cite material, **please consult with me in advance of submitting your work.**
Topics, Reading List, and Discussion questions:

Class One. Tuesday, September 4th, 2018.

Introduction.

Guiding questions:

- What does studying the history of education entail? What questions are addressed? How are they taken up?
- How have historians presented the history of Canadian schooling differently?

Secondary source reading (required):

- Axelrod, Promise of Schooling, pp. vii-x. (Book for purchase at bookstore, and available on reserve at Education Library).

Supplementary (Not required. Read only if you need more background on British Columbia and Canada in this period. You can also read selectively around events and people by using the indexes to look these up):

- Conrad, Finkel and Fryson, Canada: A History, pp. xvi-xvii (Introduction). (Book for purchase at bookstore, and one copy on reserve at Education Library.)

Class Two. Tuesday, September 11th, 2018.

Constructing Schooled and Moral Citizens in the Nineteenth Century.

Guiding questions:

- Was public schooling imposed on a reluctant citizenry; or did citizens want, welcome, request it? What can nineteenth-century compulsory attendance laws (e.g. Ontario’s 1871 law) tell us about the answer to this question?
• What types of citizen were the schools of the nineteenth century trying to create? How did they try to accomplish this?

Secondary source reading (required):

• Axelrod, Promise of Schooling, pp. 1-68. (Book for purchase at bookstore, and available on reserve at Education Library).


Primary source reading (required):

• Douglas A. Lawr and Robert D. Gidney eds., Educating Canadians: A Documentary History of Public Education (Von Nostrand Reihold: Toronto, 1973). Read the introduction by the historians, Lawr and Gidney, i.e. “C. The Role of the Church in Public Education” (not a primary source) and read primary source excerpts C.1 to C.5. (pp. 67-76) (PDFs on Canvas).


Supplementary (Not required. Read only if you need more background on British Columbia and Canada in this period. You can also read selectively around events and people by using the indexes to look these up.)

• Barman, The West Beyond the West, pp. 3-103. (Book for purchase at bookstore, and one copy on reserve at Education Library.)

• Conrad, Finkel and Fryson, Canada: A History, 1-221. (Book for purchase at bookstore, and one copy on reserve at Education Library.)

Class Three. Tuesday, September 18th, 2018.
Constructing Indian Education: 1850s-1950.
Guiding questions:

- What similarities and differences existed in the views of (a) the various First Nations (then known as “Indians”), (b) the federal government, (c) provincial education officials, (d) the churches, on the role of education in constructing “Indians”? What evidence can you offer to support your answer?
- How did the construction of “the Indian” change over time in Indian education? How would you periodize the changes?
- How are the “number treaties” (e.g. Treaty No. 7 discussed in the primary source) related to this week’s discussion of Indian education?

Secondary source reading (required):

- Axelrod, Promise of Schooling, pp. 69-77.

Primary source reading (required):


Supplementary (not required):

- Dickason and Newbigging, A Concise History of Canada’s First Nations pp. 1-233. (Book for purchase at bookstore, and one copy on reserve at Education Library.)
- Barman, The West Beyond the West, pp. 104-188.

Class Four. Tuesday, September 25th, 2018.
Constructing Race, Ethnicity, and Nationality to 1950.

Guiding questions:

- How were schools involved in the processes of creating citizens of a nation called Canada?
- How were race and ethnicity (as concepts, categories, identities) involved in the processes of schools making citizens?
- How did immigrant and racialized people respond to schooling for national citizenship?

Secondary sources – read (required):

- Axelrod, Promise of Schooling, pp. 78-87.
- Vipond, Making a Global City, pp. ix-47. (Book for purchase at bookstore, and one copy on reserve at Education Library.)

Primary sources – read (required):


Supplementary (not required):

- Dickason and Newbigging, A Concise History of Canada’s First Nations pp. 234-272. (Book for purchase at bookstore, and one copy on reserve at Education Library.)

Class Five. Tuesday, October 2nd, 2018.

Constructing Workers, Constructing Class: 1890-1940.

Guiding questions:
• How did vocationalism intend to address constructing workers for an industrial economy?
• Was vocationalism a working-class issue, or was it imposed on workers by members of a manager class?
• Did workers shape schools? How?

Secondary sources – read (required):

• Axelrod, Promise of Schooling, pp. 104-122.
• Jean Barman, “‘Knowledge is Essential for Universal Progress but Fatal to Class Privilege’: Working People and The Schools in Vancouver During The 1920s,” Labour/Le Travail 22 (Fall 1988): 9-66.

Primary sources – read (required):


Supplementary (not required):

• *** Same pages as last week (October 2nd, 2018) from Dickason and Newbigging, A Concise History of Canada’s First Nations; Barman, The West Beyond the West, and Conrad, Finkel and Fryson, Canada: A History.

Class Six. Tuesday, October 9th, 2018.
Constructing Gender: Girls into Women, Boys into Men, 1870-1930.

Guiding questions:

• How were femininity and masculinity constructed historically? What role did schools play in this?
• What “types” of women were schools trying to make girls into? What “types” of men were they trying to make boys into?
• How successful were schools at making women and men? How can we know this?

Secondary sources – read (required):

• Marta Danylewycz, “Domestic Science Education in Ontario,” pp. 127-145 in Ruby Heap and Alison Prentice eds., Gender and Education in Ontario (Toronto: Canadian Scholars’ Press 1991).
• Ryan van den Berg, “‘Thank Goodness We Have a He-Man’s School’: Constructing Masculinity at the Vancouver Technical School in the 1920s,” Historical Studies in Education/Revue d’histoire de l’éducation 28, no. 1 (Spring 2016): pp. 96-124.

Primary sources – read (required):


Supplementary (not required):

*** Same pages as Week 4/5 from Dickason and Newbigging, A Concise History of Canada’s First Nations; Barman, The West Beyond the West, and Conrad, Finkel and Fryson, Canada: A History.

Class Seven. Tuesday, October 16th, 2018.
Constructing Ability, Disability, and Deafness 1900-1950.

Guiding questions:
• How did ability and disability intersect with other identities that the schools constructed?
• How do the responses of people who were disabled to schooling compare to the responses of other groups to it?
• In what ways was special education “progressive”?

Secondary sources – read (required):


Primary sources – read (required):

• Excerpts from Helen MacMurchy, To Inspectors, Principals, and Teachers, Ontario Department of Education Pamphlets (Toronto: A.T. Wilgress, 1919), pp. 8-12.
• Excerpts from “Are All Children Alike?,” White Paper No. 4, pp. 3-8 (Toronto: Toronto Bureau of Municipal Research, 1915).

Supplementary (not required):

*** Same pages as Week 4/5/6 from Dickason and Newbigging, A Concise History of Canada’s First Nations; Barman, The West Beyond the West, and Conrad, Finkel and Fryson, Canada: A History.

Class Eight. Tuesday, October 23rd, 2018.

Guiding questions:
• What changes over time occurred in how schools produced religious, moral, and schooled pupils between the 1850s and 1960s?
• How can we know today if classrooms in circa 1950 Canadian schools were “progressive” or “traditional”? How could people in 1950 know?

Secondary sources – read (required):

• Gidney, From Hope to Harris: The Reshaping of Ontario’s Schools, pp. 9-86.
• Vipond, Making a Global City, pp. 48-76.

Primary sources – read (required):

• Excerpt from Public Schools Act, Revised Statutes of British Columbia 1960, chapter 319, section 167 (1 page).

Supplementary (not required):

• Conrad, Finkel and Fryson, Canada: A History, pp. 376-392.
• Barman, West beyond the West, pp. 286-421.

Class Nine. Tuesday, October 30th, 2018.

Guiding questions:

• What was the status of the culture and language of the Mi’kmaq in the twentieth century? How gad it change over time? How had it stayed the same? How was the education of Mi’kmaw people involved in these processes?
• What major changes to the Canada-First Nations relationship in the education field occurred after approximately 1945? What were the causes of those changes? What were the effects?
• How did the changing Canada-First Nations relationship in the education field reflect and contribute to changes in that relationship in areas other than education?

Secondary sources – read (required):


Primary sources – read (required):


Supplementary (not required):


Class Ten. Tuesday, November 6th, 2018.

**Constructing Multicultural Canada, 1950-present.**

Guiding questions:

• How were race and ethnicity involved in schools making citizens after 1950?
• What does Canadian multiculturalism look like in schools? How has this changed over time since 1950? Why has it changed and (most importantly) who made the changes?

Secondary sources – read (required):
Primary sources – read (required):

- Vipond, *Making a Global City*, pp. 77-197.
- Gidney, *From Hope to Harris*, pp. 124-164.

Supplementary (not required):

- Excerpts from Zylberberg v. Sudbury Board of Education, 1988 CanLII 189 (ON CA), [http://canlii.ca/t/1p77t](http://canlii.ca/t/1p77t), “1. Statutes and Regulations”-“6. Conclusion.” (18 pp.)
- TVO Parents. “Africentric School Update,” Published January 2010. YouTube video, 28:06. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=a5nTRYFl0S8](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=a5nTRYFl0S8)

Guiding questions:

- How did curriculum and program in K-12 schools and post-secondary institutions after 1950 reflect and contribute to a changing class structure, and changing economy, in Canada?
- How did the contribution of K-12 schools and post-secondary institutions to preparing workers change after 1950? Why? Could vocationalism still be said to exist? (Did it ever exist?)

Secondary sources – read (required):

- Paul Axelrod, Chapter 1 “Education, Utilitarianism, and the Acquisitive Society,” pp. 7-33 in *Scholars and Dollars: Politics, Economics, and the
Primary sources – read (required):


Supplementary (not required):

- Barman, West beyond the West, Same pages as Class Eight (i.e. pp. 286-421).

Class Twelve. Tuesday, November 27th, 2018.
Constructing Gender and Sexuality: Girls into Women, Boys into Men, 1950-present.

Guiding questions:

- How did schools and other sites of education construct gender in this period? How was this different than in the period prior to 1950? How was it the same?
- How did “normal” operate through schools and other sites of education? What evidence do we have for this?
- How did gender, sexuality, and race intersect in this period? What does studying that intersection tell us?

Secondary sources – read (required):


Primary sources – read (required):
  [https://www.nfb.ca/film/joe_and_roxy/](https://www.nfb.ca/film/joe_and_roxy/)

Supplementary (not required):
• Conrad, Finkel and Fryson, *Canada: A History*, Same pages as class Eight, (i.e. pp. 393-407, 443-455).
Research Help:

Bibliographies:

- “Bibliography of Canadian Educational History.”
  Repeating feature in the journal Historical Studies in Education (see below).

- Linda L. Hale, comp., Vancouver Centennial Bibliography: A Project of the
  Koerner library reference section.
  Sources for Vancouver’s history.

- Neil Sutherland, Jean Barman, and Linda L. Hale, comps. History of
  Canadian Childhood and Youth: A Bibliography (Westport, CT: Greenwood
  Secondary and primary sources for the history of Canadian young people.

Digital books

  A non-profit organization that has digitized a large number of out-of-copyright books from
  university libraries. Includes a considerable number of education books.

Indexes and databases:

- America: History & Life and Historical Abstracts. UBC libraries online.
  The two main research databases for academic books and articles and books in history. Canadian
  and American topics covered in A H&L.

Major journals for history of education:

- Historical Studies in Education/Revue d’histoire de l’éducation (Canada).
  http://historicalstudiesineducation.ca/index.php/edu_hse-rhe/index

- History of Education Quarterly (United States).

- History of Education (United Kingdom).


- Paedagogica Historica (International; mainly Europe).

Essay research and writing in history courses:

Other:

• THEN/HiER. (The History Education Network)
  
  http://www.thenhier.ca/

  Virtual network and clearing house for resources, sources, and links for history and history education in Canada.

## Rubric for Written Work in Dr. Ellis’s Graduate Classes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Superior (80-100%)</th>
<th>Satisfactory (68-79%)</th>
<th>Poor/Unsatisfactory (67%+)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| - The essay has an original and engaging thesis.  
- Thesis statement very clearly articulates the author’s (your) main contentions and cleverly introduces them.  
- Author’s (your) contentions are nearly perfectly situated in relation to the existing literature on the topic.  
- Thesis statement is very articulate, concise, and it gives the reader a precise sense of where the author (you) is going and how the author (you) will get there. | - The essay has an original thesis.  
- Thesis statement articulates the author’s (your) main contentions.  
- Author’s (your) contentions are situated in relation to the existing literature on the topic.  
- Thesis statement is articulate, gives the reader a sense of where the author (you) is going and how the author (you) will get there. | - The essay’s thesis is not original, is derived mainly from other authors’ work.  
- Thesis statement is unclear regarding the author’s main contentions.  
- Author’s (your) contentions are not well situated in relation to the existing literature on the topic.  
- Thesis statement is confused, too long or too short, gives the reader little sense of where the author (you) is going and how the author (you) will get there. |
| - The essay shows evidence of considerable scholarly research and excellent engagement with the scholarship on the topic.  
- The author (you) demonstrates an excellent command of the important concepts and the information relating to the topic. | - The essay shows evidence of scholarly research and engagement with the scholarship on the topic.  
- The author (you) demonstrates a good command of the important concepts and the information relating to the topic. | - The essay shows insufficient evidence of scholarly research.  
- The author (you) demonstrates an insufficient command of the important concepts and the information relating to the topic. |
| - The evidence used to support the author’s (your) thesis is convincing, very well-selected, and engaging.  
- The author’s (your) interpretation and analysis of primary and secondary sources is excellent. I.e.,  
- Evaluates primary and secondary sources’ content  
- Evaluates primary sources’ origins  
- Makes good inferences from primary sources.  
- Uses secondary sources to support own ideas.  
- Goes well beyond a descriptive approach. | - The evidence used to support the author’s (your) thesis is convincing and well-selected.  
- The author’s (your) interpretation and analysis of primary and secondary sources is good. I.e.,  
- Evaluates primary and secondary sources’ content  
- Evaluates primary sources’ origins  
- Makes good inferences from primary sources.  
- Uses secondary sources to support own ideas.  
- Goes beyond a descriptive approach. | - The evidence used does not support the author’s (your) thesis. Is not relevant / is inaccurate.  
- The author’s (your) interpretation and analysis of primary and secondary sources is insufficient.  
- Does not go beyond a descriptive approach. |
| The essay is well-organized and very well written. | The essay is well-organized and well written. | The essay is somewhat disorganized. The writing meanders or is verbose. |
| Writing is direct, to the point, and concise. | Writing is mostly direct, to the point, and concise. | There are a noticeable number of spelling mistakes and examples of poor grammar, sentence structure, paragraphing, or confusing formatting. |
| The author (you) has used appropriate spelling, grammar, sentence structure, paragraphing, and formatting. The writing style is engaging and artful. | The author (you) has used appropriate spelling, grammar, sentence structure, paragraphing, and formatting. | The introduction appears not to contain a thesis statement. |
| There is an introduction containing the thesis statement. | There is a proper conclusion that restates the thesis statement in different words. | The conclusion does not restate the thesis statement in different words. |
| The conclusion highlights main points of interest. | The conclusion highlights some main points of interest. | The conclusion is underdeveloped. |
| The conclusion does an excellent job suggesting further research lines on the topic (if appropriate). | The conclusion suggests further research lines on the topic (if appropriate). |

| All of the essay elements are present and all of the conditions that relate to style, formatting, and length are respected. | All of the essay elements are present and all of the conditions that relate to style, formatting, and length are respected. | Essay elements are missing or not all of the conditions that relate to style, formatting, and length are respected. |
| Citations are complete, accurate and formatted properly. | Citations are complete, accurate and formatted properly. | Citations are incomplete, inaccurate or improperly formatted. |